Functional and numerical responses of the predatory bug *Macrolophus caliginosus* Wagner fed on different densities of eggs of the greenhouse whitefly, *Trialeurodes vaporariorum* (Westwood)

ABDUL-JALIL SALEM HAMDAN

Department of Plant Production and Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Hebron University, Hebron P.O. Box 40, Palestine

Received: 7 March 2006

Accepted after revision: 1 September 2006

Laboratory experiments under standard conditions (25 °C, 50-75% relative humidity, 16:8 L:D) were conducted to determine the functional and numerical responses of the adult female of *Macrolophus caliginosus* to different densities of the greenhouse whitefly on tobacco leaf discs. The results showed that the functional response of *M. caliginosus* was density-dependent with regard to the consumption of *Trialeurodes vaporariorum* eggs at different prey densities, up to 300 *T. vaporariorum* eggs/arena/day. This response fitted the type III functional response. The numerical response of *M. caliginosus* was positively related to prey density, with more oocytes per female, a higher age-specific fecundity and higher intrinsic rate of increase at high prey densities than medium or low prey densities.

Key words: *Macrolophus caliginosus*, *Trialeurodes vaporariorum*, functional response, numerical response.

INTRODUCTION

To describe the nature of predation, two terms were initially proposed by Solomon (1949), namely the functional response, which is defined as the change in attack rate per predator with variation in prey density, and the numerical response, which is the change in predator numbers with variation in prey density. Holling (1959a, b) suggested that Solomon's functional response could be further subdivided into three types: type I, in which prey consumption increases linearly to a plateau with increasing prey density; type II, in which prey consumption increases asymptotically to a plateau with increasing prey density, and type III, in which prey consumption is S-shaped (sigmoid) with increasing prey density.

Later on, Bell (1991) and van Alphen & Jervis (1996) suggested four types of functional responses as follows:

- Type I: where there is a rectilinear rise to the maximum in the number of prey eaten per predator as the prey density increases;
- Type II: where the response rises at a constantly decreasing rate towards a maximum value, i.e. the response is curvilinear up to the asymptote, in contrast to the Type I response;
- Type III: where the response resembles the Type II response except that it accelerates at lower prey densities, the response is thus sigmoid, and
- Type IV: where the response resembles the Type II response except that at higher densities it declines, producing a dome-shape.

A method for determining the functional response was described by van Alphen & Jervis (1996) as follows:

- 1. Individual insects to be confined in an arena (e.g., cage) with different numbers of prey or hosts, for a fixed period of time.
- 2. At the end of the experiment, the natural enemies are removed and, in the case of predators, the

^{*} Corresponding author: tel.: +972 (02) 2220995 (ext. 166), fax: +972 (02) 2229303, e-mail: ajhamdan@hebron.edu

number of prey killed is counted.

- 3. From the counts, a graph can then be plotted relating the number of prey attacked to the number offered.
- The plot is then compared with the functional response curves (Holling, 1959a, 1961, 1966; Rogers, 1972; Royama, 1977; Mills, 1982; Arditi, 1983; Casas *et al.*, 1993).

Foglar et al. (1990) studied the functional response of Macrolophus caliginosus with two prey species, M. persicae and M. urticae, and found that, with both prey species, M. caliginosus showed a Holling's type II response. However, Abdel-Aziz (1994) studied the functional responses of M. caliginosus when fed on Trialeurodes vaporariorum stages offered on both tomato and cucumber, and he concluded that the functional response of M. caliginosus fitted a type II Holling's functional response curve when offered immature stages of T. vaporariorum, whereas the predator had no or only a very low response to T. vaporariorum adults. Further analysis of Abdel-Aziz data showed that the functional response of M. caliginosus actually fitted a type III curve described by van Alphen & Jervis (Hamdan, 1997). Latest studies on the functional response of M. caliginosus to whiteflies and spider mites showed that predation of the M. caliginosus female presented with first instars of greenhouse whitefly was a type III functional response (Enkegaard et al., 2001).

The objective of this experiment was to examine the functional and numerical responses of adult female *M. caliginosus* to different densities of greenhouse whitefly eggs on tobacco leaf discs.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

A culture of *M. caliginosus* Wagner was established using 500 specimens provided by the Biological Crop Protection Ltd. (BCP) at Wye, Kent, UK. The *M. caliginosus* culture was reared on tobacco plants infested with *T. vaporariorum* (Westwood), and kept in a growth room chamber under standardised conditions of 25 °C, 16:8 L:D photoperiod and of 50 - 70% relative humidity (RH). All plants with or without insects were kept inside perspex culture cages (60 × 40 × 50 cm, length × width × height) on wet capillary matting on trays.

A group of 150 (one day-old) adults of *M. caliginosus* were released onto a tobacco plant heavily infested with eggs of the greenhouse whitefly (GHWF), *T. vaporariorum*. They were kept for two days in a ventilated perspex cage $40 \times 50 \times 60$ cm in a growth chamber under standardised conditions (25°C, 50-75% RH, 16:8 L:D) to ensure copulation. On the third day, each *M. caliginosus* female was reared separately in 5 cm diameter Petri dish cages and offered a clean tobacco leaf disc for a fasting period of 24 h before starting the feeding regimes. Then, six prey density treatments were offered daily: 0, 10, 50, 100, 200 and 300 GHWF eggs/arena/day.

Two types of leaf discs were offered in each cage, one for food and another for oviposition prepared as follows:

a) 2 cm diameter tobacco leaf discs infested with the proper number of GHWF eggs as food without leaf-veins, and

b) 5 cm diameter clean tobacco leaf discs + *Pelargonium* leaf offered as oviposition site, each leaf with a midrib and/or thick veins suitable for oviposition.

Each predator was moved to freshly prepared cages every day, and the daily consumption of each replicate was recorded. All cages were kept under the standardised conditions for the incubation period and the number of nymphs emerging from each cage was recorded.

In each prey density-treatment, ten adult females were used. After one week, all live *M. caliginosus* females were weighed: four females from each treatment were placed in plastic vials and kept in a freezer for later dissection in order to determine the effect of the different prey densities on the number of developed oocytes in the ovarioles of each female. The other *M. caliginosus* females were left to continue feeding on the same prey density until death.

The life table parameters were calculated using the QBasic program (Jervis & Copland, 1996) (Appendix). Hence, this experiment started with adult stages and, therefore, the analyses were done on the basis of the results obtained by Hamdan (1997) who found nymph survival of 86% and adult eclosion at age of 27 days with a female percentage of 39% (14:22 F:M).

The data used from this experiment to calculate the life table parameters included the age-specific fecundity, the proportion of survival during the adult stage and the calculated age-specific "fertility" of *M. caliginosus* female during its adult life.

RESULTS

Functional response

The average number of GHWF eggs consumed per *M. caliginosus* female increased significantly with in-

Prey density (n*) (GHWF eggs/cage/day)	Number of GHWF eggs consumed/day	% of GHWF eggs consumed***	
0 (21)	0.0 ^d	0.0 ^e	
10 (52)	$7.1 \pm 0.452^{\text{ d}}$	70.8 ± 4.52 ^b	
50 (54)	$40.7 \pm 2.04^{\circ}$	81.3 ± 4.08 ^a	
100 (75)	$67.3 \pm 3.24^{\text{b}}$	67.3 ± 3.24 ^b	
200 (43)	92.1 ± 3.91^{a}	46.0 ± 1.95 °	
300 (55)	93.5 ± 4.82^{a}	31.2 ± 1.61 ^d	
<i>p</i> value	< 10 ⁻³	< 10 ⁻³	

TABLE 1. Numbers and percentages of GHWF eggs consumed by *Macrolophus caliginosus* females fed on different prey densities (means \pm se^{**})

* = n: number of replications (days)

** = means within the same column with different letters differ significantly at the 0.001 level (one way ANOVA, Tukey's family error rate)

*** = se calculated from the equation se = $100\sqrt{pq}/n$, where p = proportion consumed, q = 1-p



FIG. 1. Functional response of *Macrolophus caliginosus* fed on GHWF eggs.

creasing prey density within the range of 0-200 GHWF eggs/arena/day, above which the daily consumption was stable and without any significant increase (Table 1 and Fig. 1). However, the proportion consumed tended to increase with increasing prey density, reaching a maximum of 81% at 50 GHWF eggs/arena/day, after which it decreased at higher densities (Table 1).

Results in Fig. 1, showed that the functional response of *M. caliginosus* to increasing densities of GHWF eggs fitted a type III functional response, which was recently described by van Alphen & Jervis (1996). This response resembles the Holling's (1959a) type II, except that, at lower prey densities, the percentage consumed accelerated to reach a peak at a prey density over 50 GHWF egg/arena/day before starting to decline at higher densities.

Numerical response

The results in Table 2 show the effect of prey density on adult longevity, oviposition period, and total nymphs produced and average nymphs/female/day during the oviposition period. These parameters tended to increase with increasing prey density but this effect was not significant. *Macrolophus caliginosus* females survived on the control treatment (0 GHWF egg/day) for an average of 12.5 days, presumably feeding on plant juice, and produced an average of seven nymphs per female.

On the other hand, when the analyses were done on the basis of three prey density ranges i.e., low density ranging from 0 to10 GHWF eggs/arena/day, medium density ranging from 50 to 100 GHWF eggs/ arena/day and high density ranging from 200 to 300 GHWF eggs/arena/day, the results in Table 3 show that, the adult weight, number of developed oocytes/female, number of offspring produced during the first 10 days and the mean number of offspring produced/female, are all significantly higher when fed on medium and high prey density than fed on low prey density.

The results in Fig. 2 show that the cumulative number of nymphs/female tended to increase with increasing prey density and the oviposition period of the *M. caliginosus* females offered a high prey density (200-300 GHWF eggs/arena/day), double that of the females offered medium or low prey density (< 100 GHWF eggs/arena/day).

Fig. 3 shows that the "fertility" of *M. caliginosus* increased with increasing prey density, with a significantly higher age-specific fecundity and a longer ovi-

Prey density/day (GHWF eggs)	Adult longevity (days)	Oviposition period (days)	Average number of nymphs/female	Mean number of nymphs/female/day of oviposition period
0	12.5 ± 1.48	5.7 ± 1.54	7.0 ± 2.19	1.2 ± 0.37
10	10.3 ± 1.23	4.3 ± 1.65	9.0 ± 3.26	1.9 ± 0.42
50	12.3 ± 2.08	4.7 ± 2.55	11.0 ± 6.07	1.3 ± 0.61
100	13.8 ± 2.44	5.0 ± 2.13	14.8 ± 7.31	1.7 ± 0.68
200-300	15.5 ± 2.78	9.8 ± 3.34	31.7 ± 15.6	2.4 ± 1.04
<i>p</i> value**	0.509	0.462	0.259	0.730

TABLE 2. Adult longevity and number of nymphs emerged/female fed on different prey density treatments (means \pm se; n* = 6)

* = n: number of replications

** = *p* value for comparison between different densities (one way ANOVA, Tukey's family error rate)



FIG. 2. Cumulative number of offspring/female/day when females fed on prey densities of 0, 10, 50, 100 and 200-300 GHWF eggs/arena/day.

TABLE 3. Effect of prey	density on adult v	veight and fertilit	y of Macrolophus	caliginosus ((means ± se*)
-------------------------	--------------------	---------------------	------------------	---------------	---------------

Prey density range GHWF eggs/arena/day	Adult weight at day 10 (mg)	Number of oocytes/ female on day 10	Mean nymphs/female/ 1 st week of oviposition	Mean nymphs/ adult period
Low density <10	$0.899^{b} \pm 0.020$ (15)	$1.5^{b} \pm 0.327$ (8)	$7.6^{b} \pm 1.12$ (20)	$8.0^{b} \pm 1.89$ (12)
Medium density 50-100	$1.112^{a} \pm 0.042$ (17)	$3.87^{a} \pm 0.693$ (8)	$11.2^{ab} \pm 2.7$ (20)	$12.9^{ab} \pm 4.57$ (12)
High density 200-300 <i>p</i> value	$1.193^{a} \pm 0.053$ (9) <10 ⁻³	$4.75^{a} \pm 1.25 (4) 0.011$	$21.1^{a} \pm 7.4$ (10) 0.037	$31.7^{a} \pm 15.6$ (6) 0.0069

* = means within the same column with different letters differ significantly at the 0.05 level (one way ANOVA, Tukey's family error rate)



FIG. 3. Number of viable offspring produced/female/day when fed either on low, medium or high prey density.

position period at the higher densities. The oviposition period increased with increasing prey densities and reached 14 days on low, 17 days on medium and 23 days on high prey densities. Furthermore, one peak of eggs laid/female fed on low prey density occurred on day 5, two peaks when fed on medium prey density occurred on day 5 and on day 12 and five peaks when fed on high prey density occurred on day 4, 10, 15, 17 and 22.

Life table

The results in Table 4 show that the life table parameters were affected by the prey density range. The gross reproductive rate (GRR), the net reproductive rate (Ro), the capacity for increase (rc), the intrinsic rate of increase (rm), the cohort generation time (Tc), the generation time (T) and the finite capacity for increase (l) were all increased in proportion to the increasing prey density, whilst the doubling time (DT) declined with increasing prey density.

	Prey density range (GHWF eggs/arena/day)			
Life table parameters	Low (<10)	Medium (50-100)	High (200-300)	
GRR	4.8	8.4	27.6	
Ro	3.4	5.4	13.4	
rc	0.03754481	0.0496974	0.0696475	
rm	0.03767337	0.0500907	0.0726776	
Tc	32.8	34.0	37.3	
Т	32.7	33.7	36.5	
1	1.038392	1.051366	1.07869	
DT	18.4	13.8	9.7	

TABLE 4. Life table parameters* of Macrolophus caliginosus fed on either a low, medium or high prey density of GHWF eggs

* = life table parameters: GRR, gross reproductive rate; Ro, net reproductive rate; rc, capacity for increase; rm, intrinsic rate of increase; Tc, cohort generation time; T, generation time; I, finite capacity for increase; DT, doubling time

DISCUSSION

Functional response

Macrolophus caliginosus shows significant responses to different densities of GHWF eggs. The results of the current study resemble those by Enkegaard *et al.* (2001) who found that predation of *M. caliginosus* fed on GHWF fits type III functional response.

In previous studies, Foglar et al. (1990) and Abdel-Aziz (1994) reported that the functional response of M. caliginosus females showed a type II Holling's response (Holling, 1959a) when reared on either M. persicae, M. urticae (Foglar et al., 1990) or T. vaporariorum (Abdel-Aziz, 1994). Although, Abdel-Aziz (1994) determined the functional responses by comparing the curves for the number of prey consumed with increasing densities using the Holling's type responses, he did not discuss the proportion consumed. Hamdan (1997) suggested that further analysis of Abdul-Aziz data, using the curves for the proportion consumed in addition to the curves of the numbers consumed showed that the data also fit to type III responses of van Alphen & Jervis (1996). In conclusion, the complete analysis of the data by Abdel-Aziz (1994) is in agreement with the results of the present study.

It seems possible that the type of response is related to prey size, with a type III response for small prey and, type II for larger prey. Hassell et al. (1977) reported that Notonecta glauca L. (Hemiptera) preying on Asellus aquaticus L. (Isoptera) had a type III response for small (3-5 mm) A. aquaticus, and a type II response for larger individuals (7-9 mm). The same authors also reported that Coccinella septempunctata L. (Coleoptera) also produced a type III functional response when foraging for first instar cabbage aphid Brevicoryne brassicae L. (Aphididae) and a type II response when foraging for fifth instar. Streams (1994) concluded that the prey size might affect the functional response of the predator and that the predator could have a type II functional response on larger prey and a type III on smaller prey. Therefore, it can be concluded that the functional response of M. *caliginosus* fits a type III when foraging for small prey, such as GHWF and a type II when foraging for larger prey, such as M. persicae (Hamdan, 1997).

Numerical response

Macrolophus caliginosus showed a significant increase in body weight and in the number of developed oocy-

tes/female (one week after the introduction of the different feeding regimes). These increases were proportional to the increase in prey density. In addition, adult longevity, age-specific fecundity and the cumulative number of nymphs produced/female also increased in proportion to the increase in prey density. Thus, five peaks of egg oviposition occurred when M. caliginosus females were fed on high prey density, two peaks on medium prey density and only one peak on low prey density. This shows that when a satisfactory food was available, more oocytes developed and the oviposition period was longer. Therefore, the intrinsic rate of increase was positively correlated with the increasing prey density, resulting in a proportional decrease in the doubling time of the M. caliginosus population.

The present study shows that *M. caliginosus* showed a positive numerical response to prey density. When foraging at high prey densities, *M. caliginosus* tended to have high rates of increase, to survive for longer, to produce more nymphs and to double its population more quickly than when foraging at medium or low prey densities. In addition, it was found that when *M. caliginosus* adults were released, they were able to survive and to produce offspring even in the absence of insect prey.

The effects of prey density on the numerical response of *M. caliginosus* were in general agreement with the responses of other heteropteran predators fed at varying prey densities. In particular, with *Anthocoris confusus* fed on the aphid *Aulacorthum circumflexus* (Buckton) (Evans, 1976), with *Podisus maculiventris* fed on *Tenebrio molitor* L. (O'Neil & Wiedenmann, 1990; Wiedenmann & O'Neil, 1990), and with *Podisus maculiventris* given low numbers of *Epilachna varivestis* Mulsant as a prey (Legaspi & O'Neil, 1993, 1994).

CONCLUSIONS

- The functional response of *M. caliginosus* is density-dependent with regard to the consumption of GHWF eggs at different prey densities up to 200 GHWF eggs/arena/day. This response fitted the type III functional response described by van Alphen & Jervis (1996).
- 2. The numerical response of *M. caliginosus* was positively related to prey density, with higher adult weight, more oocytes per female, a longer period of oviposition, a longer period of adult survival, a higher age-specific fecundity, a higher intrinsic

152

rate of increase and a shorter doubling time at high prey densities than medium or low prey densities.

3. *Macrolophus caliginosus* has the ability to survive and produce offspring when released as adult, even in the absence of prey.

REFERENCES

- Abdel-Aziz AMA, 1994. Predatory bug *Macrolophus caliginosus* Wagner as a biocontrol agent of greenhouse whitefly, *Trialeurodes vaporariorum* (Westwood). M. Sc. Thesis, Imperial College, University of London.
- Arditi R, 1983. A unified model of the functional response of predators and parasitoids. *Journal of animal ecology*, 52: 293-303.
- Bell WJ, 1991. *Searching behaviour*. Chapman and Hall, London.
- Casas J, Gurney WSC, Nisbet R, Roux O, 1993. A probabilistic model of functional response of parasitoid at the behavioural time scale. *Journal of animal ecology*, 62: 194-204.
- Enkegaard A, Brodsgaard HF, Hasen DL, 2001. *Macrolophus caliginosus*: Functional response and preference and switching capacity between whiteflies and spider mites. *Entomologia experimentalis et applicata*, 101: 81-88.
- Evans HF, 1976. The effect of prey density and host plant characteristics on oviposition and fertility in *Anthocoris confusus* (Reuter). *Ecological entomology*, 1: 157-161.
- Foglar G, Malausa JC, Wajnberg E, 1990. The functional response and preference of *Macrolophus caliginosus* (Heteroptera: Miridae) for two of its prey: *Myzus persicae* and *Tetranychus urticae*. *Entomophaga*, 35: 465-474.
- Hamdan AJS, 1997. Biological and ecological studies on the predatory bug *Macrolophus caliginosus* Wagner (Heteroptera: Miridae) as a biocontrol agent against the greenhouse whitefly *Trialeurodes vaporariorum* (Westwood) (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae). Ph. D. Thesis, Wye College, University of London.
- Hassell MP, Lawton JH, Beddington JR, 1977. Sigmoid functional responses by invertebrate predators and parasitoids. *Journal of animal ecology*, 46: 249-262.

- Holling CS, 1959a. The components of predation as revealed by a study of small mammal predation of the European pine sawfly. *The canadian entomologist*, 91: 293-320.
- Holling CS, 1959b. Some characteristics of simple type of predation and parasitism. *The canadian entomologist*, XCI: 585-598.
- Holling CS, 1961. Principles of insect population. *Annual* review of entomology, 6: 163-183.
- Holling CS, 1966. The functional response of invertebrate predators to prey density. *Memoris of the entomological society of Canada*, 48: 1-87.
- Jervis MA, Copland MJW, 1996. The life cycle. In: Jervis M, Kidd N, eds. *Insect natural enemies: Practical approaches to their study and evolution*. Chapman and Hall, London: 63-162.
- Legaspi JC, O'Neil R, 1993. Life history of *Podisus maculiventris* given low number of *Epilachna varivestis* as prey. *Environmental entomolology*, 22: 1192-1200.
- Legaspi JC, O'Neil R, 1994. Lipids and egg production of *Podisus maculiventris* (Heteroptera: Pentatomidae) under low rates of predation. *Environmental entomology*, 23: 1254-1259.
- Mills NJ, 1982. Satiation and functional response: a test of new model. *Ecological entomology*, 7: 305-315.
- O'Neil R, Wiedenmann RN, 1990. Body weight of *Podisus* maculiventris (Say) under various feeding regimens. *The canadian entomologist*, 122: 285-294.
- Rogers D, 1972. Random search and insect population models. *Journal of animal ecology*, 4: 369-383.
- Royama T, 1977. Population persistence and density dependence. *Ecological monographs*, 47: 1-35.
- Solomon ME, 1949. The natural control of animal populations. *Journal of animal ecology*, 18: 1-35.
- Streams FA, 1994. Effect of prey size on attack components of the functional response by *Notonecta undulata*. *Oecologia*, 98: 57-63.
- van Alphen JJM, Jervis MA, 1996. Foraging behaviour. In: Jervis M, Kidd N, eds. *Insect natural enemies: Practical approaches to their study and evolution*. Chapman and Hall, London: 1-62.
- Wiedenmann RN, O'Neil RJ, 1990. Effects of low rate of insect predation on selected life-history characteristics of *Podisus maculiventris* (Say) (Heteroptera: Pentatomidae). *The canadian entomologist*, 122: 271-283.

154

Appendix: QBasic program for the calculation of life table parameters (c.f. Jervis & Copland, 1996)

10 REM program to calculate life table parameters (MJWC 1996) 15 CLS 20 DIM x(100), k(100), m(100): REM dimension arrays (n < 100) 30 READ n 35 FOR h = 1 TO n: READ x(h), k(h), m(h): NEXT h: REM read data 40 PRINT "calculating data" 50 ct = 0: mx = 0: ro = 0: j = 1: REM set variables 60 REM - - - - - - - - - - - - - cumulative calculations 70 FOR h = 1 TO n80 ct = ct + x(h) * k(h) * m(h): mx = mx + m(h): ro = ro + k(h) * m(h)90 NEXT h 100 rc = LOG(ro) / (ct / ro): rm = rc: REM calculate rc110 crm = 0: FOR h = 1 TO n 115 crm = crm + k(h) * m(h) * EXP(-x(h) * rm): NEXT h120 REM ----- iterative substitution for rm 130 IF ABS(1 - crm) < .00001 THEN GOTO 180: REM accurate to 4 dec points 140 IF crm > 1 THEN rm = rm + ABS(1 - crm) / x(1)150 IF crm < 1 THEN rm = rm - ABS(1 - crm) / x(1)160 PRINT j: j = j + 1: GOTO 110 170 REM - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - display results 180 PRINT "gross reproductive rate (GRR) ="; mx 190 PRINT "net reproductive rate (Ro) ="; ro 200 PRINT "capacity for increase (rc) ="; rc 210 PRINT "intrinsic rate of increase (rm) ="; rm 220 PRINT "cohort generation time (Tc) ="; ct / ro 230 PRINT "generation time (T) ="; LOG(ro) / rm240 PRINT "finite capacity for increase (lambda) ="; EXP(rm) 250 PRINT "doubling time (DT) ="; LOG(2) / rm 260 END 270 REM 280 REM ----- data 290 DATA 23: REM number of days data 300 DATA 27, .86, .00: REM x (day), lx (survival), mx (fecundity) 310 DATA 28, .86, .00: REM female offspring